HUMAN TRAFFICKING FOR AN ORGAN REMOVAL (HTOR): A CALL FOR PREVENTION, PROTECTION, PROSECUTIONS AND INVESTIGATIONS

Debra Budiani-Saberi, Ph.D
Coalition for Organ-Failure Solutions (COFS)
MODERN ERA OF ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION

1954 - first successful kidney transplant conducted in Boston
1960s - liver, pancreas and heart
1980s - lung and living-related lung and liver

SUCCESS of TRANSPLANTATION
1) tissue typing and
2) immunosuppressant drugs

→ donors and recipients no longer had to be relatives but could be biologically, socially and geographically distant
Scope

World Health Organization (March 2007) estimate:

Illicit kidney removals for transplantation account for 5–10% of the approximately 65,000 kidney transplants performed annually throughout the world.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Economic/ Financial</th>
<th>Social</th>
<th>Psychological/ Regret</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>78 % a deterioration in their health status</td>
<td>- 58 % effects on health were very negative.</td>
<td>• 68 % did not tell anyone about their donation</td>
<td>94 % felt regret about their donation and an inability to get further assistance from those involved with their donation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>58 % effects on health were very negative.</td>
<td>• kidney vending caused somewhat (20%) to very (66%) negative financial effects.</td>
<td>• 68 % families strongly disagreed with vending, which increased marital conflicts in 73 % of vendors.</td>
<td>• preoccupation with kidney loss was usual (30%) to always (57%).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>86 % a deterioration in their health status.</td>
<td>• average family income declined by one-third after nephrectomy.</td>
<td>• 70 % of vendors isolated from society.</td>
<td>79 % would not recommend that others sell a kidney.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>98 % a deterioration in general health status.</td>
<td>• 96 % sold their kidneys to pay off debts.</td>
<td>• 37 % concealed the truth of kidney sale from anyone.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>48 % negative effects:</td>
<td>• 88 % had no economic improvement in their lives.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 'Now I get tired more easily than before'  
- 'I became weaker'  
- 'I cannot carry heavy things as I could before'
NATIONAL LAWS ESTABLISHED ON ORGAN TRAFFICKING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, renal failure = tuberculosis →

↑

D
FATMA’S ABDUCTION

NOVEMBER 2011
CBD is not dilated.

Spleen is average in size, pattern is homogenous.

Pancreas appears homogenous.

Kidneys:

Right kidney is average in size, site, shape and parenchymal pattern, No stones, cysts, or backpressure changes. It measures 12.6x5.5 cm.

Left kidney is surgically removed

No ascitis or lymphadenopathy.

Normal course and caliber of abdominal aorta and IVC.

**OPINION:**

SOLITARY RIGHT KIDNEY

Best regards,

DR. HOSAM EL-SHAER, MD
The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children defines trafficking in persons as:

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.
The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children defines trafficking in persons as:

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.
The United Nations Protocol to Prevent,Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children defines trafficking in persons as:

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.
The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children defines trafficking in persons as:

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. **Exploitation shall include**, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.
The UN Protocol criminalizes human trafficking, including for the removal of an organ.

The United States ratified this Convention in 2005.
ISTANBUL DECLARATION ON ORGAN TRAFFICKING AND TRANSPLANT TOURISM

In 2008 experts on organ trafficking established the definition of organ trafficking to mean:

the recruitment, transport, transfer, harboring, or receipt of living or deceased persons or their organs by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability, or of the giving to, or the receiving by, a third party of payments or benefits to achieve the transfer of control over the potential donor, for the purpose of exploitation by the removal of organs for transplantation.
ISTANBUL DECLARATION ON ORGAN TRAFFICKING AND TRANSPLANT TOURISM

In 2008 experts on organ trafficking established the definition of organ trafficking to mean:

the recruitment, transport, transfer, harboring, or receipt of living or deceased persons or their organs by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability, or of the giving to, or the receiving by, a third party of payments or benefits to achieve the transfer of control over the potential donor, for the purpose of exploitation by the removal of organs for transplantation.
In 2008 experts on organ trafficking established the definition of organ trafficking to mean:

the recruitment, transport, transfer, harboring, or receipt of living or deceased persons or their organs by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability, or of the giving to, or the receiving by, a third party of payments or benefits to achieve the transfer of control over the potential donor, for the purpose of exploitation by the removal of organs for transplantation.
KEY CONCEPTS IN CASES OF HTOR

1. organs are largely not transported independent of persons in commercial transplants
KEY CONCEPTS IN CASES OF HTOR

1. organs are largely not transported independent of persons in commercial transplants

2. the majority of cases involve (implicit) coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, the giving of payments or benefits and the abuse of power or vulnerability for the removal of an organ.
KEY CONCEPTS IN CASES OF HTOR

1. organs are largely not transported independent of persons in commercial transplants.

2. the majority of cases involve (implicit) coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, the giving of payments or benefits and the abuse of power or vulnerability for the removal of an organ.

3. consent is irrelevant because incentives are presented with the intention to traffic and in so doing, victims are defrauded (i.e. duped, deceived, mislead, given false information).
KEY CONCEPTS IN CASES OF HTOR

1. organs are largely not transported independent of persons in commercial transplants

2. the majority of cases involve (implicit) coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, the giving of payments or benefits and the abuse of power or vulnerability for the removal of an organ.

3. consent is irrelevant because incentives are presented with the intention to traffic and in so doing, victims are defrauded (i.e. duped, deceived, mislead, given false information)

4. the receipt of payments or benefits for an organ does not exclude cases from being considered HTOR
KEY CONCEPTS IN CASES OF HTOR

1. **organs are largely not transported independent of persons in commercial transplants**

2. the majority of cases involve (implicit) coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, the giving of payments or benefits and the abuse of power or vulnerability for the removal of an organ.

3. **consent** is irrelevant because incentives are presented with the intention to traffic and in so doing, victims are defrauded (i.e. duped, deceived, mislead, given false information)

4. the receipt of payments or benefits for an organ does not exclude cases from being considered HTOR

5. **an individual can also be received for the purpose of an organ removal- i.e. they may have been recruited indirectly**
RECOMMENDATIONS

The United States government should:

1. add human trafficking for an organ removal (HTOR) to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA).
RECOMMENDATIONS

The United States government should:

1. add human trafficking for an organ removal (HTOR) to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA).

2. extend the extraterritorial jurisdiction of the National Organ Transplant Act (NOTA) to ban U.S. citizens or legal residents from engaging in organ tourism.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The United States government should:

1. add human trafficking for an organ removal (HTOR) to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA).
2. extend the extraterritorial jurisdiction of the National Organ Transplant Act (NOTA) to ban U.S. citizens or legal residents from engaging in organ tourism.
3. encourage urgent action in key countries where HTOR continues to thrive including but not limited to Egypt and India.
RECOMMENDATIONS

The United States government should:

1. add human trafficking for an organ removal (HTOR) to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA).
2. extend the extraterritorial jurisdiction of the National Organ Transplant Act (NOTA) to ban U.S. citizens or legal residents from engaging in organ tourism.
3. encourage urgent action in key countries where HTOR continues to thrive including but not limited to Egypt and India.
4. support the development of further evidence-based investigations by NGOs and government bodies and support programs that provide outreach to victims of HTOR.
EVIDENCE BASED, VICTIM-CENTERED FINDINGS

- Egypt - Sudanese Victims
- India
Egyptian Victims
Sudanese Victims of Organ Trafficking in Egypt

A Preliminary Evidence-Based, Victim-Centered Report

December 2011

To view the full report, visit www.cofs.org
FINDINGS- SUDANESE VICTIMS IN EGYPT

• COFS-Egypt identified 57 Sudanese refugees and asylum seekers in Egypt who said they were victims of HTOR for a kidney
• interviewed 12 of these victims
• arranged medical follow-up care for 5 of them
• ultrasounds and physical exams confirmed that kidneys had been removed in all 5 cases.
FINDINGS- SUDANESE VICTIMS IN EGYPT

• 39 (68%) are from Darfur
• 26 (46%) are female
• 5(9%) are children
FINDINGS- INDIA

- 1500 victims identified in Chennai and Erode (more being identified in Calcutta and Bangalore)
- 111 victims interviewed and provided medical follow-up
- 73 percent are female
- 94 percent reported that debt drove them to the kidney sale